

Erasing the Transactional:

Argumentation as Authentic, Action-Based Learning



BOSTON
DEBATE
LEAGUE

Mary Dibinga
Boston Latin Academy

Sarah Mayer
Boston Debate League

Who Are We in the Room?

Mary Dibinga

10th grade ELA at Boston Latin Academy
BDL Board Member, EBA Teacher, After-School Debate
Coach, Calderwood Fellow

Sarah Mayper

Evidence-Based Argumentation Instructional Coach,
Urban Science Academy, West Roxbury Academy,
Henderson K-12 Inclusion School

Activator - Turn & Talk

- ◆ What is your content area & grade?
- ◆ What does Evidence Based Argumentation mean to you?



Outcomes

By the end of the workshop, learners will leave with:

1) Understanding of EBA Strategies:

- ❖ Specific EBA strategies for student-centered collaborative discourse.
- ❖ EBA as a scaffold towards stronger student independence, intellectual engagement, and skill development.

2) Experiences with EBA:

- ❖ 3 core EBA activities and insight into how these activities can work in classrooms



Agenda

Time	Agenda
10:45-10:52	Welcome
10:52-11:15	EBA Activity #1: Evidence Scavenger Hunt
11:15 -11:25	EBA Activity #2: Collaborative Arguments Pass the Paper
11:25-11:35	EBA Activity #3: Mini Debate
11:35-11:50	EBA Activity Planning Practice
11:50-11:55	De-brief & Application to Practice
11:55-12:00	Questions & Google Survey



Once Finished, Students Resist Revision



“For individual writers willingness to revise...changes at different stages of the writing process. We can better understand these variations if we think of writing as a substance that “sets up” at some point in the process, like concrete. Beyond that point, when language and thought have lost malleability, extensive changes require something on the order of dynamite.”



and Hjortshoj, 2004)



Pitfalls of Traditional Revision Strategies

Feedback comes late in the process, disconnected from task of creation

Revision is teacher-owned

Self-revision is moot, teacher will give the “correct” feedback later

Motivation for revision is to appease teacher/finish draft

Revision comes after draft already feels complete

Revision is conflated with editing
(end-of-task polishing)



Impact on Students

- 1) **Revision as an intellectual, cognitively demanding task, not a check-off list of changes to copy**
- 2) **Revision as a live “real time” activity, not finishing touches after writing is complete**
- 3) **Revives writing process as cycle rather than linear task**
- 4) **Focus is on Micro-revisions as small steps rather than large end-of-process task**
- 5) **Students Internalize and lead Evaluation of Writing**
- 6) **Motivates and Incentivizes strong writing products**



How Do We Support Student Learning in Discourse Communities?

“organizing collaborative learning effectively requires doing more than throwing students together with their peers with little or no guidance or preparation”

“to think well as individuals, we must learn to think well collectively – that is, we must learn to converse well”

(Bruffee, 1984)



What is EBA?

An instructional strategy that arms teachers with a set of tools to teach their existing curriculum.



Biology students debate about which characteristic of life is the most important.



History students dig into historians' opposing views about which battle was the turning



Math students explore which is the best method of finding the slope of a line.

Reading Time

Please read the [Personal Essay “Fish Cheeks”](#)
from your handout.

3 minutes!!!

(It's rushed, but we promise, you'll have time
to go back to it in more depth!)

Activity: Scavenger Hunt

- How this activity can be scaffolded for differentiated instruction.
- How this activity aligns to cognitive demand and academic discourse.
- How this activity aligns to Common Core Standards

[Evidence Scavenger Hunt handout](#)

[Introduction of EBA Core Activity #1: Evidence Scavenger Hunt](#)



Activity: Basic Argument Practice

Evidence Scavenger Hunt

Directions:

Work together as a group of 3 to find quotes from the text that support or refute each of the following statements, and write a complete “basic argument” to prove your position. Record your answers on your [Evidence Scavenger Hunt handout](#).

**Use the frame for a basic argument:
Claim, Evidence, Reasoning (C, E, R)**

It's a race! Points will be awarded:

- ✧ Every team that correctly completes the evidence and reasoning will receive **1 point**.
- ✧ The first group to do so for each claim will receive **2 points**.
- ✧ The best reasoning for each claim will receive **3 points**.





Evidence Scavenger Hunt: EBA Skill #2

Name: _____

Class: _____

Date: _____

Directions:

Students will race in pairs to both find textual evidence and to explain how the text either **supports** or **disproves** the claim. Points will be awarded:

1. Every team that correctly completes the evidence and reasoning will receive **1 point**.
2. The first group to do so for each claim will receive **2 points**.
3. The best reasoning for each claim will receive **3 points**.

CLAIM Support or Oppose the projected claim.	
EVIDENCE Write the supporting evidence, including "quote" and page/line number.	
REASONING Explain how the evidence supports or disproves the claim.	



Why Use Scavenger Hunt As a Writing and Revision Activity?


- Students repeatedly practice paragraph format while engaging critically and intellectually with text.
- Students receive immediate feedback and correction on paragraph format, then apply it minutes later in next round.
- Students participate in evaluation of paragraphs both within group and in choosing winners from other groups.



Video Example & Alternate Paragraph Forms

Video Context: 10th Grade ELA at Boston Latin Academy, Boston Public School's "second tier exam school" (similar to a magnet school).

Student body is roughly 20% each Asian, Black, Hispanic and White and is economically diverse, drawn from all of Boston's neighborhoods.



The video uses this paragraph format



Activity: Pass the Paper

How this activity aligns to cognitive demand and [academic discourse](#).

- Collaborative writing promotes academic discourse.
- Focus on Questioning levels using [HESS Matrix](#) to help students engage in analyzing and synthesizing information to build arguments with a focus on reasoning = CDT.
- Group revision process focusing on higher-order questioning strategies to promote cognitive demand and metacognition around writing choices and idea development in written arguments = CDT.

[Pass the Paper handout](#)



[Walk through of Collaborative Arguments Pass the Paper](#)



Activity: Pass the Paper

1. Students sit in a circle.
2. Teacher will provide students with a template with the following claim: **Tan uses the following literary element to make this passage more vivid: syntax/diction/detail/perspective.**
3. Students will be instructed to check a claim in box 1 of the left-hand column and then pass their sheet to the person on their left.
4. Students will next use the Evidence Sheet to select evidence explaining why that claim might be true in box 2.
5. Students will pass the paper to their left again, where the next person will supply the reasoning explaining how that evidence supports the claim in box.



Pass the Paper (PTP) Game: EBA Skill #4

(from AP Literature course Close Reading literary analysis revision lesson)

Directions: Please sit in a circle. Write a Claim in the left-hand column and then pass this sheet to your left, where the person next to you will add the Evidence for your Claim. That person will pass the paper to the next person who will add the Reasoning that ties that Evidence to the Claim. Then the next person will add a question about the argument that either exposes an assumption or seeks new information about the argument. Then pass the paper one more time to the left, where the last person will use the question to rewrite the complete Argument to be even stronger.

Argument (Claim + Evidence + Reasoning)	Question
<p>1. Claim: Tan uses interesting stylistic choices in _____ to make this passage more vivid:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diction • Syntax • Detail • Perspective 	<p>4. Questioning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Checks if Evidence is Sufficient • Exposes Assumption • Seeks New Information <p>Sample Question Starters: How are you defining...? When is that true / not true...? Who is that true/not true for...? What did you mean by...? Have you considered...?</p>
<p>2. Evidence:</p>	
<p>3. Reasoning:</p>	
<p>Rewritten Argument (Claim + Evidence + Reasoning)</p>	



Why Use Pass the Paper As a Writing and Revision Activity?

- Students practice constructing a thesis and selecting evidence.
- Students explore many different arguments.
- Students analyze and evaluate peer work and receive feedback on their own.
- Students can practice revision early in the writing process before they have fully committed to one idea.



Activity: Mini Debate

- [Mini Debate Handout](#)
- How this activity can be [scaffolded](#) for [differentiated instruction](#).
- How this activity aligns to cognitive demand and [academic discourse](#).
- How this activity aligns to [Common Core Standards](#)
- [Mini Debate Resource for take-away](#)



Activity: Mini Debate

Before the Mini Debate:

1. Write your assigned claim in the chart on [your handout](#).
2. Think about your claim as related to *Fish Cheeks*.
3. Find two pieces of evidence to support your claim and write them in your chart.
4. Write reasoning that explains how each piece of evidence supports your claim.




Activity: Mini Debate

During the Mini Debate

1) You and your opponent will each have one minute to speak during the mini-debate.

- Use your notes when it is your turn to speak.
- Take notes when your opponent speaks.

**BOSTON DEBATE LEAGUE**

Name: _____ Class: _____ Date: _____

Mini Debate: EBA Skill #2

Fish Cheeks Mini Debate

Claim A: Amy's mother understands her.

Claim B: Amy's mother doesn't understand her.

WORD BANK: In your debate, you must use at least three of the words in the bank:

Directions:

1. Before the Mini Debate write your assigned claim in the chart on the next page, and the three



Name: _____ Class: _____ Date: _____

Mini Debate: EBA Skill #2**MY claim is:*****Argument #1***

Evidence

Reasoning: How does this evidence support your claim?

Argument #2

Evidence

Reasoning: How does this evidence support your claim?



Activity Planning Practice

<https://tinyurl.com/y8ma9c99>

Activity Planning Practice

Save a copy of this document, share it to your group members, and then follow the directions below.

Time Allotment Guide	Activity Step Directions	Completed Work
5 min.	<p>Select one subject area for your team.</p> <p>1) Read the text for your chosen subject area:</p> <p><u>Math:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• High School - Triangles• Middle School Ratios <p>English</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Shakespeare <p>History</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Branches of Government <p>ESL/MFL</p>	<p>PROBLEM OF PRACTICE:</p> <p>OBJECTIVE:</p> <p>"Students will be able to..."</p> <p>"</p>

Debrief EBA Activities

+	Modifications



Closing

Thank you for your participation!

Google Survey for this Session:

<https://goo.gl/forms/2N7D0KEeyQOnLRWE2>

[Want more information on EBA?](#)

Contact Information

Mary Dibinga

mdibinga@bostonpublicschools.org

Sarah Mayer

smayer@bostondebate.org

